United States | New term, same balancing act

America's college heads revise rules for handling campus protests



University leaders have learnt some lessons, but face a tough test this autumn

AS SOME STUDENTS shopped for Columbia hoodies and Taylor Swift crochet sets in the university bookshop, and others bought apple-cider doughnuts at a farmers' market, it almost felt like a normal back-to-school September. But as classes resumed last week at Columbia University, the heart of last spring's campus unrest over the war in Gaza, it was impossible to avoid renewed pro-Palestinian protests or the changes they have brought.

Access to the campus is restricted to those with university ID. Near the main entrances, a conservative outfit set up two digital billboards that flashed the names and faces of people they considered to be "Columbia's Leading Antisemites". Long queues blocked the gates periodically. On the first day back, a few dozen protesters shouted pro-Palestinian slogans and two were arrested. Inside the gates someone threw red paint on Alma Mater, a statue outside Low Library.

College leaders used the summer to develop plans that might prevent disruptions, tackle antisemitism and minimise resort to police forces. The difficulty of that balancing act can be measured by the number of college presidents who have resigned while attempting to carry it out, including Minouche Shafik at Columbia, who stepped down in August. Despite much reflection and preparation, the autumn may offer her successor and other university leaders little respite. The anniversary on October 7th of the attack on Israel by Hamas is one likely flashpoint.

The problem remains how to combine a commitment to free speech with effective policies to prevent antisemitism, while also enabling all students to learn free of disruption. The First Amendment's speech protections apply only to state action, notes Lee Bollinger, a former president of Columbia and a free-speech scholar. So whereas public universities funded by the state must allow unfettered speech, private ones are under no specific obligation.

Fully adopting a First Amendment standard on private campuses would mean protecting "hate speech or speech that advocates illegal action, or speech that advocates deeply offensive ideas", Mr Bollinger says. Many universities believe that would be inconsistent with their mission.

Tom Stritikus, the president of Occidental College, a liberal-arts college in Los Angeles, has implemented restrictions on the permissible "time, place and manner" of demonstrations. Protests can take place only 25 between 6am and midnight. Demonstrations cannot be mounted in buildings or block access, and no permanent or semi-permanent structures such as tents are allowed. Amplified speech (from bullhorns, for example) is also forbidden. Many other colleges have applied similar restrictions.

In an effort to limit the resort to police, Columbia University has hired more security guards and trained them in de-escalation techniques. In a written statement Katrina Armstrong, Columbia's interim president, said that she supports "the right to free expression... but those rights cannot come at the expense of the rights of others to live, work, and learn here, free from discrimination and harassment". Last month the university's task-force on antisemitism concluded after conducting interviews with hundreds of Jewish and Israeli students that the university "had not treated them with the standards of civility, respect and fairness it promises to all its students".

35

College leaders have realised that they must prevent harassment and discrimination while also teaching students to handle some speech they do not like—another tricky balancing act. How they do this varies. Discussions can get heated and people can disagree," says Ravi Rajan, the president of the California Institute of the Arts, which specialises in arts education. "But ostensibly one of the things that we're doing as educational institutions is teaching students how to have those arguments."

(586 *words*)

www.economist.com